

SOUTH HAMS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE



Minutes of a meeting of the **South Hams Development Management Committee** held on **Wednesday, 20th January, 2016 at 10.30 am** at the **Council Chamber - Follaton House**

Present: **Councillors:**

Chairman Steer
Vice Chairman Foss

Bramble
Cuthbert
Hodgson
Pearce
Vint

Brazil
Hitchins
Holway
Rowe

In attendance:

Councillors:

Baldry
Tucker
Wright

Hopwood
Ward

Officers:

50. **Declarations of Interest**

DM.50/15

Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered and the following were made:

Cllr Pearce declared a disclosable pecuniary interest in application **55/2213/15/VAR:** Variation of conditions 3 (approved plans), 9 (landscaping) and 11 (boundary enclosure) of planning consent 55/2134/12/RM to allow resiting and screening of air source heat pump and revisions

to boundary treatment – 8 Whimbrels Edge, Thurlestone, by virtue of having already made representations on this application and she left the meeting for the duration of the debate and vote on this item;

Cllr Hodgson declared a personal interest in application **2621/2015/FUL**: Erection of 1no. dwelling on land adjacent to Weir Nook – Weir Nook, Weirfields, Totnes, by virtue of knowing the landowner in a personal capacity and she remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon;

Cllr Brazil declared a disclosable pecuniary interest in application **27/1859/15/F**: Erection of 77 dwellings, including all associated public space, landscaping and all other associated external works – Proposed development site at SX 6203 5630, Woodland Road, Ivybridge, by virtue of comments he made at the site inspection for this application. He apologised to his fellow Committee Members and to officers for the comments that he had made and then left the room for the duration of the debate and discussion on this item.

51. **Minutes**

DM.51/15

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 16 December 2015 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

52. **Public Participation**

DM.52/15

The Chairman announced that a list of members of the public who had registered their wish to speak at the meeting had been circulated.

53. **Planning Applications**

DM.53/15

The Committee considered the details of the planning applications prepared by the Planning Case officers as presented in the agenda papers, and considered also the comments of Town and Parish Councils together with other representations received, which were listed within the presented agenda reports, and **RESOLVED** that:

Ivybridge **27/1859/15/F** **SX 6203 5630, Woodland Road,**
Parish: Ivybridge

Erection of 77 dwellings including all associated public space, landscaping and all other associated external works

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Steve Pitcher; Supporter – Mr Andrew West; Town Council Representative – Cllr Ann Laity; Ward Member Cllr Saltern

Officer's Update:

- An email had been circulated to all Councillors regarding the viability assessment;
- Confirmation had been received from the Lead Local Flood Authority that the proposed drainage management scheme would be effective and represented betterment;
- The recommendation was therefore revised to remove the reference to requiring the above confirmation;
- A correction was noted to the last sentence of the third paragraph of the section titled 'Conclusions'. This should have read: 'Of particular importance are measures to secure a landscape plan and surface water management plan';
- The proposed Affordable Housing (AH) split is 50% Affordable Rent and 50% Shared ownership;
- The increase to 30% AH had necessitated minor layout amendments at the northern end of the site;
- A Highway Safety Audit had been received and reviewed by Devon County Council Highway Authority on Monday 18 January 2016. This demonstrated that the access, relocated bus stop and pedestrian / cyclist provision had been designed to meet safety standards;
- A revised plan had been received indicating that the main road would be adopted, but that the three spurs would be privately owned. A footpath had been added on the eastern side of the main road and three parking spaces removed;
- Advised that a Travel Plan would be required and that this would be secured as part of the s106 Agreement;
- Advised that in addition to s106 money, the applicant was proposing £28,500 towards cycling and road safety measures (other than the direct provision in the application); and
- Clarified that the Officer recommendation was for conditional approval and that delegated authority be granted to the COP Lead Development Management to finalise the details of the s106 and s278 legal agreements and conditions.

Recommendation: That Conditional Approval of the application be delegated to the COP Lead Development Management subject of conditions, prior satisfactory

completion of a Section 106 Agreement, a Section 278 Agreement, and confirmation that the Highways authority have no objections to the proposed access and parking arrangements.

During debate on this item, Members raised concerns regarding specific elements of the design of the proposal, including access to certain properties, access to open space areas, issues of wheelie bin storage and parking arrangements. The DCC Highways Authority representative responded to concerns relating to highways and confirmed that the Highways Authority were satisfied with the proposal. The DCC Flood Risk Officer responded to questions and concerns relating to drainage and flooding on site, and concerns about potential flooding in neighbouring locations as a result of this proposal. The representative from Level Ltd responded to Members questions relating to the viability of the proposal.

To conclude the debate on this item, a number of Members expressed their concerns and sought deferral of the application to enable the applicant to reconsider the design of the proposal.

Committee Decision: That the application be deferred to allow the applicant an opportunity to address concerns expressed by councillors with respect to layout and design.

**37/831/15/F SX552 481 Barnicott, Bridgend Hill,
Newton Ferrers
Parish: Newton and Noss**

Provision of new dwelling

Speakers included: Supporter – Mrs Amanda Burden; Parish Council Representative – Cllr Alan Cooper; Ward Member – Cllr Baldry (a written statement from Ward Member Cllr Blackler was also presented)

Officer's Update: N/A

Recommendation: Refusal

Committee Decision: Refusal

55/2213/15/VAR 8 Whimbrels Edge, Thurlestone

Parish: Thurlestone

Variation of conditions 3 (approved plans), 9 (landscaping) and 11 (boundary enclosure) of planning consent 55/2164/12/RM to allow re-siting and screening of air source heat pump and revisions to boundary treatment

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Steve White; Supporter – Mr Neil Redfearn; Parish Council Representative – Cllr Tony Goddard; Ward Member – Cllr Wright

Officer's Update: N/A

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Site Inspection

**2621/15/FUL Land adjacent to Weir Nook,
Weirfields, Totnes
Parish: Totnes**

Erection of 1no. dwelling on land adjacent to Weir Nook

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Jonathan Brook; Supporter – Mr Andrew Kirby; Town Council representative – Cllr Rose Adams; Ward Members – Cllr Horsburgh and Cllr Vint

Officer Update: N/A

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

1. Time
2. Accords with plans
3. Material samples to be agreed
4. Parking to be provided and maintained
5. Removal of PD
6. Single storey roof not to be used as a balcony/amenity area
7. High level window in first floor south west elevation
8. Unsuspected contamination
9. Boundary fence on northern boundary with Glenroy to be retained as a solid boundary of the same height to maintain privacy
10. Construction Management Plan to be agreed prior to commencement of development

**20/2136/15/F
Portlemouth**

1 Longpark Cottages, East

Parish: East Portlemouth

Householder application for proposed relocation of external garden steps linking lower patio with upper terrace and lawn

Speakers included: Supporter – Mr Paul Fleming; Parish Council Representative – Cllr Lindsay Lindley; Ward Member – Cllr Brazil

Officer's Update: Additional letter from neighbour – material planning considerations not already mentioned in report were reported as update:

- Plans inaccurate
- Patio could be sited elsewhere
- It is the patio that is overbearing, dominant and intrusive not the trellis
- Rear access is important due to fire risk of thatched cottage
- Small fence does not mitigate overlooking

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

1. Time
2. Accords with plans
3. Stairs to be relocated and screen fence erected within three months of date of approval
4. Details of trellis to be approved prior to installation
5. Screen fence to be retained in perpetuity

35/1782/15/LB

**Croppins Coombe, Modbury
Parish: Modbury**

Listed building consent for alterations and extension

Recommendation: Refusal

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

1. Time
2. Accord with plans
3. Schedule of repair and reinstatement of historic roof structure, beams, joists, lintels etc

4. Window and door details
5. Lime mortars, plasters and renders

35/2366/15/F

**Croppins Coombe, Modbury
Parish: Modbury**

Alterations and extensions to existing house and domestic curtilage

Speakers included: Supporter – Mrs Pam Wilcox; Parish Council Representative – Cllr Bernard Taylor; Ward Member – Cllr Lindsay Ward

Recommendation: Refusal

During the debate on this item, a number of Members expressed the view that the proposed design was of such a high standard that it outweighed the reasons for refusal of the application. Members also stated that the applicant had a track record of renovating and supporting heritage within the South Hams. Whilst there was a responsibility to conserve assets, there was nothing that stated the narrative of a building should stop at this point. Other Members appreciated the reasons for refusal and agreed that the proposed extension was not subservient to the building and therefore the application should be refused in line with officer recommendation. A more modest extension would be more appropriate in this setting.

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Reasons:

The desirability of sustaining and enhancing a heritage asset and putting it to use.

Conditions:

1. Time
2. Accord with plans
3. Unidentified contaminated land
4. Landscaping
5. Materials samples
6. Details of rooflights, vents, ducts etc
7. Joinery details
8. Archaeological recording

53/2412/15/F

**Seagulls, Hallsands, Kingsbridge
Parish: Stokenham**

Demolition of existing house, provision of new house, improvements to access parking and landscape

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Tom Hoeksma; Supporter – Mr John Blaney; Parish Council Representative – Cllr Tim Lynn; Ward Member – Cllr Brazil

Officer's Update: N/A

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

1. Standard Time Limit
2. Accord with Plans
3. Unsuspected Contamination
4. Landscaping – details submitted to be constructed and thereafter maintained for identified period of time
5. Ecology – accord with recommendations
6. Construction Management Plan
7. Vulnerability Assessment (detail of condition delegated to COP Lead Development Management in consultation with Chairman of Development Management Committee and the local Ward Member)

**2695/15/LBC 5 Clifton Place, Salcombe
Parish: Salcombe**

Listed building consent for replacement of 1no. existing window and remedial works to exterior render, beneath replacement window following tidal erosion

Officer's Update: N/A

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

1. Time
2. Accord with Plans

54. **Planning Appeals Update**

DM.54/15

Members noted the presented list of appeals.

The Meeting concluded at 6.20 pm

Signed by:

Chairman

This page is intentionally left blank

Voting Analysis for Planning Applications – DM Committee 20 January 2016

Application No:	Site Address	Vote	Councillors who Voted Yes	Councillors who Voted No	Councillors who Voted Abstain	Absent
27/1859/15/F	SX 6203 5630, Woodland Road, Ivybridge	Deferral	Cllrs Pearce, Hitchins, Holway, Rowe, Hodgson, Vint, Bramble (7)	Cllrs Cuthbert, Steer, Foss (3)	Cllr Brazil by virtue of declaring an interest (1)	Cllr Cane (1)
37/1831/15/F	Development site at SX 552 481, Barnicott, Bridgend Hill, Newton Ferrers	Refusal	Cllrs Steer, Foss, Cuthbert, Brazil, Pearce, Hitchins, Holway, Rowe, Hodgson, Vint, Bramble (11)	(0)	(0)	Cllr Cane (1)
55/2213/15/VAR	8 Whimbrels Edge, Thurlestone	Site Visit	Cllrs Foss, Bramble, Hodgson, Holway, Brazil, Rowe, Hitchins (7)	Cllrs Cuthbert, Steer (2)	Cllr Pearce by virtue of declaring a DPI (1), Cllr Vint (1)	Cllr Cane (1)
2621/15/FUL	Land adj. to Weir Nook, Weirfields, Totnes	Conditional Approval	Cllrs: Rowe, Steer, Holway, Bramble, Hodgson, Vint, Foss, Brazil (8)	(0)	Cllrs Cuthbert, Pearce, Hitchins (3)	Cllr Cane (1)
20/2136/15/F	1 Longpark Cottages, East Portlemouth	Refusal	Cllrs Brzil, Vint, Hodgson, Cuthbert, Pearce (5)	Cllrs Holway, Rowe, Bramble, Steer, Foss (5) Application Not Refused on Chairman's Casting Vote	(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)
20/2136/15/F	1 Longpark Cottages, East Portlemouth	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Holway, Rowe, Bramble, Steer, Foss (5) Application Approved on Chairman's Casting Vote	Cllrs Brzil, Vint, Hodgson, Cuthbert, Pearce (5)		Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)
35/1782/15/LB	Croppins Coombe, Modbury	Refusal	Cllrs Foss, Rowe, Pearce, Cuthbert, Hodgson (5)	Cllrs Holway, Bramble, Vint, Steer, Brazil (5) Application not Refused on Chairman's Casting Vote	(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)
35/1782/15/LB	Croppins Coombe, Modbury	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Holway, Bramble, Vint, Steer, Brazil (5) Application Approved on Chairman's Casting Vote	Cllrs Foss, Rowe, Pearce, Cuthbert, Hodgson (5)	(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)
35/2366/15/F	Croppins Coombe, Modbury	Refusal	Cllrs Foss, Rowe, Pearce, Cuthbert, Hodgson (5)	Cllrs Holway, Bramble, Vint, Steer, Brazil (5) Application not Refused on Chairman's Casting Vote	(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)

35/2366/15/F	Croppins Coombe, Modbury	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Holway, Bramble, Vint, Steer, Brazil (5) Application Approved on Chairman's Casting Vote	Cllrs Foss, Rowe, Pearce, Cuthbert, Hodgson (5)	(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)
53/2412/15/F	Seagulls, Hallsands, Kingsbridge	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Steer, Rowe, Pearce, Cuthbert, Bramble, Hodgson, Holway (7)	Cllrs Vint, Brazil, Foss (3)	(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)
2695/15/LBC	5 Clifton Place, Salcombe	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Holway, Hodgson, Vint, Brazil, Foss, Steer, Pearce, Cuthbert, Rowe, Bramble (10)		(0)	Cllrs Cane, Hitchins (2)

This page is intentionally left blank